

CITY OF OSWEGO, NEW YORK

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

March 16, 2021

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mark Brunschweiger, Anthony Pauldine, Mark Donabella, Michael Nicholson, Connie Ryan, Richard Lafond, Matthew Brancato, and Chairman Clavelli.

MEMBERS ABSENT: None.

Chairman Clavelli called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m., Tuesday March 16, 2021. Roll call was duly noted.

A motion to approve the minutes of the February 2021 meeting was made by Richard Lafond and seconded by Anthony Pauldine; minutes unanimously approved.

Chairman Clavelli made a motion that all actions taken tonight are excluded, exempt or Type II actions for the purpose of the State Environmental Quality Review Law unless otherwise stated. Motion seconded by Mark Brunschweiger; unanimous approval.

CITY OF OSWEGO, NEW YORK

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

RESOLUTION

CASE NO: 21-26

IN THE MATTER OF: John Trimble

WHEREAS, John Trimble, owner of property situate in a TN1, Traditional Neighborhood 1 Zoning District in the 1st Ward of the City of Oswego, New York, with address 30 West Fifth Street, being Tax Map Number: 128.45-07-11.02, has applied for a Height Area Variance in accordance to Section 280-78(A)(1)(2) of the City of Oswego Code, to allow for the construction of a six foot (6') high hedge and;

WHEREAS, due public notice having been given of a Hearing on said matter to be held on the 16th day of March 2021 and the applicant having appeared and no one appearing in opposition.

John and Julie Trimble of 30 West Fifth Street were present for the discussion. Mr. Trimble said they are looking to build a residential home. He said there will be a basement that will double as a garage, a first story and a second story. He said the right of way goes quite a way back into the yard. He said they would like the variance to have a 10' separation instead of 25'. He said along the edge their intention is to put a natural hedge and keep it along the sides no higher than 6'. He said they will extend it forward into the right of way area to a certain extent. He said the third issue is the lot coverage. Jeff McGann said the maximum coverage allowed is 30%. He said they are proposing 46% so they are looking for a 16% variance which is pretty common in the city because of the size of the lots. He said a hedge right of way is treated the same as a fence so the maximum height is 6'. He said in the first 25' you can only be 4' high so that is one of the variances. He said the Trimbles have already gone before the Committee and Council to get use of public space. He said this will line them up with the other houses on the street. Chairman Clavelli asked if there was anyone for or against this application and no one came forward. He asked if the siding and architecture will blend in with the neighborhood. Mr. Trimble said yes. He said it will be a gray cement fiberboard and he thinks the character will match the nature of the neighborhood. Mr. Caraccioli asked if the parking under the house will be accessed off of 5th Street. Mr. Trimble said yes. Mr. Caraccioli said the cement walk that goes to nowhere will be taken out and they will be driving through there. Mr. Trimble said yes. He said part of the work they were looking to do in the city right of way is to, within ADA requirements, lower that sidewalk to the extent they can to make it feasible to make a driveway go up in there. Jeff McGann said Councilor McBrearty sent an email asking as the project continues they work with the city engineer. He said this has already been discussed. Chairman Clavelli asked for the record if they will work with the city engineer. Mr. Trimble said yes. Jeff McGann said if you look at the east elevation on the diagrams they will see the side stairs look like they are floating. He said that is because of the topography. He said to each side of the man door those are actually garage doors and that will be the entry to the garage.

Richard Lafond said he will have a double wide driveway. Jeff McGann said yes. He said it'll be two cars wide.

RESOLVED, that a Height Area Variance be granted to allow for the construction of a six foot (6') high hedge.

MOTION MADE BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Brunschweiger

SECONDED BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Donabella

CITY OF OSWEGO, NEW YORK

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

RESOLUTION

CASE NO: 21-27

IN THE MATTER OF: John Trimble

WHEREAS, John Trimble, owner of property situate in a TN1, Traditional Neighborhood 1 Zoning District in the 1st Ward of the City of Oswego, New York, with address 30 West Fifth Street, being Tax Map Number: 128.45-07-11.02, has applied for a Front Yard Setback Area Variance in accordance to Section 280-12(C) of the City of Oswego Code, to allow for the construction of a new single family dwelling and;

WHEREAS, due public notice having been given of a Hearing on said matter to be held on the 16th day of March 2021 and the applicant having appeared and no one appearing in opposition.

RESOLVED, that a Front Yard Setback Area Variance be granted to allow for the construction of a new single family dwelling.

MOTION MADE BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Brunschweiger

SECONDED BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Donabella

CITY OF OSWEGO, NEW YORK

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

RESOLUTION

CASE NO: 21-28

IN THE MATTER OF: John Trimble

WHEREAS, John Trimble, owner of property situate in a TN1, Traditional Neighborhood 1 Zoning District in the 1st Ward of the City of Oswego, New York, with address 30 West Fifth Street, being Tax Map Number: 128.45-07-11.02, has applied for a Maximum Lot Coverage Area Variance in accordance to Section 280-12(C) of the City of Oswego Code, to allow for the construction of a new single family dwelling and;

WHEREAS, due public notice having been given of a Hearing on said matter to be held on the 16th day of March 2021 and the applicant having appeared and no one appearing in opposition.

RESOLVED, that a Maximum Lot Coverage Area Variance be granted to allow for the construction of a new single family dwelling.

MOTION MADE BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Brunschweiger

SECONDED BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Donabella

CITY OF OSWEGO, NEW YORK

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

RESOLUTION

CASE NO: 21-19

IN THE MATTER OF: Wade Smith

WHEREAS, Wade Smith, owner of property situate in a TN2, Traditional Neighborhood 2 Zoning District in the 2nd Ward of the City of Oswego, New York, with address 33 East Ninth Street, being Tax Map Number: 128.24-04-28, has applied for a Special Permit in accordance to Section 280-13(B) of the City of Oswego Code, to allow for a group residence and;

WHEREAS, due public notice having been given of a Hearing on said matter to be held on the 16th day of March 2021 and the applicant having appeared.

Wade Smith of 274 Syracuse Avenue was present for the discussion. Mr. Smith said he was requested by the City that the three houses owned by Grace and Glory and run by Bridge to Hope be considered group residences. He said he is the director of Bridge to Hope which is a DBA under Grace and Glory. He said they have run these houses for the last five years. He said he was a pastor at the Oswego Alliance Church for 15 years and resigned from that position two years ago to take on this new opportunity. He said the mission for Bridge to Hope is to provide hope to the individuals in Oswego County by providing safe, transitional housing for homeless and housing vulnerable individuals and families and equip them with the tools needed to maintain a healthy lifestyle. He said their goals are to provide housing for individuals and families in order to break the cycle of poverty. He said housing will be from 6 months up to a year to accomplish these goals. Second, assist individuals and families in partnering with existing organizations such as Victory Transformation, Arise, DSS, etc. Third, assist individuals and families to find jobs and receive training in life skills in order to become independent and off of social assistance. Fourth, to assist individuals and families to transition into permanent housing that will allow them to sustain a healthy lifestyle. Fifth, to address the physical, mental, and spiritual needs of the individuals and families through counseling and mentoring. He said as he looked around the city and saw the need that was here he felt the desire and call to get more involved. He said the first home they purchased was at 148 West 7th Street and then they purchased two other houses. He said there are 12 men that are part of the program. He said there is another house that they rent as well in order to meet the City's standard of no more than four individuals in a house with different names. He said they help these men find work, assist them in finding areas of weakness, and how they can come alongside and help transition them from the place they are at to a healthy part of our community. He said there are a number of things that are required of them as they live in the house. He said they need to volunteer 10 hours a week in the community. He said they may not use any alcohol or drugs or they are dismissed from the program. He said they are asked to do chores while they are in the house. He said they are asked to attend Bible study once a week at his house. He provided a list of the house rules and what they need to sign in order to be a part of Bridge to Hope. He said

this is something he believes the city needs to help the homeless and those in a place of addiction to give them a second chance. He said working with these individuals is challenging. He said you can define success very differently. He said he believes success for many of these men is a daily thing of not only staying sober but taking the steps necessary in order to get back on track. He said it's about them becoming a part of society once again. He said some of these individuals cannot find housing and are living on the street otherwise. He said their desire is to come alongside of them and provide accountability, direction, and assist them in their process. Chairman Clavelli asked if there is an overseer on a daily basis for these homes. Mr. Smith said yes. He said he allows guys who have raised up through the program to oversee. Chairman Clavelli asked if overnight guests are allowed. Mr. Smith said they are not allowed to have any visitors on the property at any time unless is okayed by him. He said a social worker may come there to visit. He said this is something he feels very strongly about because people they have associated with in the past may not be the people they need to associate with in the present. Chairman Clavelli said if this was to pass the head overseer for each place should go to the neighbors and give them their name and number or Mr. Smith's number so he would be their first contact if there are problems. Mr. Smith said he thinks that is a great suggestion. Richard Lafond asked the turnover rate. Mr. Smith said that is hard to answer. He said he has had guys that have been there for the full year and others that have lasted just a couple of weeks. He said there's a screening process they go through. He said many of the men are recommended from other programs to them. He said if they violate any of the rules that are set up, they are dismissed from the program and asked to leave. Richard Lafond asked how many graduate versus those that don't make it. Mr. Smith said the percentage that graduate and move on is probably around 10%. He said defining success with these individuals is very difficult. He said if they leave the program, have a job, and may still struggle with sobriety because sobriety is a process he would consider that a success. He said he wouldn't necessarily say that they were part of that 10%. He said those that go on and are sober, find a home and a job, and get a vehicle then that is what he would say would be the 10 to 15%. He said he would say the majority are successful. He said it may not be how we deem fully successful such as getting off of public assistance but he does believe there is success in 80 to 85% of these gentlemen. Chairman Clavelli asked if they pay rent. Mr. Smith said yes. He said some are on SSI and DSS. He said once they start working they are responsible for paying the rent at that point. He said their goal is to get everyone working that can possibly find jobs. Connie Ryan asked if he has formal training in this type of counseling. Mr. Smith said he wouldn't say he has formal training in this but that is where they lean on Farnham, OCO, Victory Center, Arise, and other community agencies. He said he doesn't claim to be an alcohol counselor but they try to get them connected with the appropriate organizations within our community that do specialize in those things. Mark Brunschweiger asked if any of these homes have a security system. Mr. Smith said that was one of the requests of the Planning Board that they add surveillance cameras. He said they have not done that yet but they will be doing surveillance cameras at the entrances to these houses. Anthony Pauldine asked if he will be maintaining the four person per household as maximum. Mr. Smith said at this point he is not considering going beyond that because he has not been giving permission to do that. He said there is one house they can put up to seven people in but at this point they are comfortable with four. He said four men in the house that are dealing with some of these things seems appropriate at this point. Anthony

Pauldine asked what the purpose for requesting this change was. He asked if it was in order to be allowed to put more than four people in a house. Mr. Smith said when he went to get his last rental permit he was asked by the City to come before the Board for a group residence. He said it wasn't his request and he would've been fine to keep going the way it was. He said it was the City's request because of other houses in the city doing similar type work to have them all under the same umbrella. Anthony Pauldine asked if this is granted will it supersede the limit of four people per household. Mr. Caraccioli said the Board can establish conditions and that could be a reasonable condition of approval to maintain no more than four in the household. Mr. Smith said six years ago when they were starting this, he approached the City to explain what they were going to do. He said at that point it was explained about four people with different last names in a single-family home. He said they have maintained that up to this point. Mr. Caraccioli read the definition of group residence. He said it excludes the definition of family. He said it is in the definition of family that no more than four unrelated that they are talking about is included. Anthony Pauldine asked if the overseer is also someone that is in the program at the same time. Mr. Smith said they are individuals that have gone through the program up to a year and he has asked them to stay on in that role because they have shown success in their own journey. Anthony Pauldine said there are various pictures of conditions in the packet that he assumes are fairly recent. Jeff McGann said he will jump back to the comment of four unrelated in the house. He said for a group residence there is a requirement for parking and that is 3 parking spaces plus one for every room to be rented out. He said the place on 7th Street would require seven parking spaces and they have one off-street parking spot. He said the parking reduction granted by the Planning Board was for 6 parking spaces. He said this was based on four people. He said one of the stipulations the Planning Board put upon their approval was a requirement that code enforcement tour these properties to make sure they were up to code and there weren't any violations. He said there wasn't a time frame put on that. He said Mr. Smith came in to set up a time to have his houses inspected. He said two of the code inspectors went to the three properties and the pictures and the letters of violations are included in the packets. He said our zoning code does not allow for a special permit to be granted when there is a violation on properties. He said if this were to pass it would have to be conditional on the fact that all of these violations would have to be corrected before the special permit could be granted. He said the violation letters and pictures are from about a week ago. Mr. Smith said he is not sure of which violations they are referring to but he believes they took care of the things they needed to. He said Dan came around to look at things to approve them so he is not sure what violations are still outstanding. He said they addressed the cleaning of the yards, carbon monoxide, and a GFI for a hot water heater. He said as far as he knows they addressed everything that was on the list unless there are other things that he is not aware of. Jeff McGann said these inspections were not random. He said it was a scheduled inspection at all three houses. Anthony Pauldine said he assumes he has had a chance to look at the pictures. Mr. Smith said he has not. Anthony Pauldine said they show pictures of rotting windows, large areas of missing siding, and peeling paint. He said from the pictures they appear to be very run down houses. He asked if all of those issues would have to be corrected. Jeff McGann said yes, in order for the special permit to be issued. He said he would recommend they take a vote tonight but it be conditional if it passes that all the violations are taken care of. Chairman Clavelli asked, whether this passes or not, to please be a good neighbor and clean

them up, paint them, and make them look a part of the neighborhood that they all love. Mr. Smith said they have already bought shingles for one place. He said they recognize that work needs to be done specifically on one house. He said siding has been measured and ordered but it is about eight weeks out. He said they are already proceeding to accomplish those things. He said it would be helpful for him to know what those violations are because he thought they had addressed those things that needed to be addressed. Mr. Caraccioli asked how he addresses unruly residents. Mr. Smith said much of what they do is try to work with individuals to try to understand why they are doing the things that they are. He said in certain cases they do evict individuals based on them not following the rules. He said there was one individual that drank this past weekend and he left the house the next day. He said it is something they do follow through on. He said the men see that, know that, and they sign an agreement saying they will stick to these things and follow through on what they are asked. He said they understand it is a privilege to be a part of this and if they do not follow the rules then they are asked to leave. He said they don't just say you are out but they try to help them transition into something else. He said they try not to just kick them out onto the street but transition them into a place where they continue to heal. Mr. Caraccioli said just so they are clear when he started doing this five years ago he did approach the City and the direction he was given was to apply for a rental permit. Mr. Smith said yes. Mr. Caraccioli asked if he has ever or does he now rent to anyone that is not in his program. Mr. Smith said no. He said if anyone wants to see the house rules and what they need to sign he has a few copies here. Mr. Caraccioli said if he is offering them they would accept them and make them a part of the record. Richard Lafond said this is not a new purchase. He asked how they got into such disrepair. Mr. Smith said they have shingled and sided the one at 148 West Seventh. He said from what it was five years ago to what it is now is a significant difference. He said there were animals in the attic. He said they took out 3 to 4 dumpster loads of debris from the house from the previous owner. He said in his opinion they've brought it a long way but there is absolutely more to do. He said 35 E. 9th Street was bought from the bank. He said it was down to the studs and they brought it from that to a place where it is like brand new inside. He said there is more work to do outside. He said it was very overgrown in the back. He said at 33 E. Ninth they have done little to the outside. He said in that property there was a hole in the floor in the living room, there was a motorbike sitting in the living room, there were guns in the upstairs, and it was a mess. He said they have owned this one for about two years. He said they have done some things. He said the inside is basically brand new but more needs to be done. He said he loves the neighborhood and they have done a lot to bring them forward to where they are now from what they once were. He said at 148 they replaced some windows and they have bought more windows that are sitting in the garage waiting to be replaced. He said they are going to do the bottom floor first and a year from now they will do the upper floor because of finances. He said the plan is to continue to better these houses but from where they once were to where they are now he believes they are much better. Mr. Caraccioli said 148 W. 7th Street was purchased in 2015, 35 E. 9th Street was purchased in 2017, and 33 E. 9th Street was purchased in 2018. He said the assessed value of 148 W. 7th Street was \$68,000 and that figure has not changed since 2006. He said 33 E. 9th Street has been \$29,000 since 2006. He said 35 E. 9th Street was \$39,000 and in 2019 it was increased to an assessed value of \$52,900. He said no other property near these homes have lost value with the exception of 150 W. 7th Street. He said that was \$79,000 and was reduced

to \$69,200. He said this occurred in 2015 prior to the purchase of the house next-door by Grace and Glory. He said these are public record facts related to these properties. Chairman Clavelli said for the discussion they are going to combine all of these properties. He asked if there was anyone opposed to these applications and Councilor Hill came forward. Councilor Hill said the W. 7th Street property is in his ward. He said he is not personally against the project and he commends the pastor for the work he is doing. He said he is here on behalf of his constituents who have expressed concerns to him. He said their main concerns are related to parking and increased police activity and destruction. He said in their review of granting a special permit he thinks those are relevant issues they should review in making that decision. He said the convenience of the neighbors and any impact on the neighbors should be considered. The next to come forward was Justin White of 146 West 7th Street. Mr. White said he purchased his house 15 years ago and at the time it was the highest value property on the street. He said his property is adjacent to the one in question. He said his property goes to their foundation. He said he owns 54 x 100 and they own 33 x 100. He said their house takes up the majority of their property. He said they have a small backyard. He said they have limited parking space for probably two small cars and possibly only one in the winter. He said Grace and Glory purchased the house in November 2015 and nine months later there was an attempted break-in into his house in the middle of the night. He said one of their tenants confused their house with his house. He said he was a convict just released from jail, attempting to break into his house and damaging his storm door. He said he felt like he was going to be attacked in his own home. He said he called 911 and the police arrived and arrested him for violation of probation. He said he was under the influence of either drugs or alcohol. He said he was confused as to where he was and thought he was being locked out of his living space. He said the city court put a restraining order against him. He said the man started using his address as his mailing address. He said he couldn't get the police or the post office to help him with stopping that. He said in his opinion he got a slap on the wrist for the threats he made against him. He said it was the first time he felt unsafe in the City of Oswego and he still doesn't feel safe. He said the majority of these men get evicted due to relapse incidents. He said there was another incident at the house when the window facing his house was shattered. He said all the broken glass was in his side yard. He said he has a mower that does the grass for him and he could have been harmed and his lawn mower could have been damaged. He said the window was covered with cardboard cut from a TV box instead of repairing the window. He said likely they didn't report it to their insurance because they wouldn't have been viable for insurance anymore with violent situations occurring within their facility. He said another serious problem is smoking in public and in the neighborhood. He said the people housed there were smoking on the sidewalks and throwing their cigarette butts in his yard and in the street and along the curb. He said when they were smoking, he and pedestrians were exposed to secondhand smoke. He said it was very difficult to work outside in his yard because of that. He said these tenants feel free to use his yard because Mr. Smith's lack of enforcement and his mistruth that he has the right to use his yard. He said this house is not supervised daily. He said when they were siding the house they left all the empty boxes and debris in his yard. He said he complained to Mr. Smith and it was a long wait for it to be cleaned up. He said they throw wrappers and other litter in his yard that he has to clean up. He said his house is eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. He said with this neighborhood situation it doesn't seem the right time to put an effort into

that. He said the value of his property will surely decline with this kind of usage and abuse. He said when he purchased his house 15 years ago it was all single-family homes. He said that Mr. Smith stated at the Planning Board meeting that he would not want a group home in his neighborhood. He said the house was in dire need of repair when they acquired it. He said it was deemed uninhabitable at that point. He said he purchased this with the knowledge that there was no way to increase the footprint of the house or the parking limitations that they all have on the street. He said he owns to the foundation of Mr. Smith's house. He said Mr. Smith has decided to ignore this saying there is a button in the sidewalk that proved differently. He said he has his extensive survey that was done 15 years ago to prove the property line. He said he was told by the city engineer that his survey was irrelevant but he believes otherwise. He said now he is claiming hardship. He said hardship shouldn't come six years later. He said it is obvious that he doesn't have the personal ability to abide by group home requirements that were read to them tonight. He asked how one person is going to supervise three houses daily. He said he doesn't feel safe with security cameras because he doesn't know where the evidence of the camera is. He said their houses are located directly across from the hospital emergency room entrance, the Covid testing center, and the hospital delivery dock. He said there is no parking on the street from 9-5:00pm. He said the constant traffic of delivery trucks, ambulances, and police cars do not make off-street parking easy. He said they may want to reduce his choices for this special permit but sometimes the answer has to be a hard no even if you are sympathetic to his causes. He said this administration has tried to improve neighborhoods making his neighborhood a TN2. He said it wasn't done to permit makeshift shelters. He said the city engineer said he would be glad to have a group home next to him in his neighborhood. He said he would strongly suggest he not only talk the talk but walk the walk and get the Kingsford Woods development rezoned for the use of this group home. He said Mr. Smith is not his neighbor and he has no intention of becoming one. He said he has shown no concern outside of his own purpose. He stated himself he would not want a group home next to him. He said this house was purchased for \$8,000 and when this group came next door to him it was the first time he felt the changes in his hometown. He said all of his doors and windows are locked because of these people. He said he is here to strongly object. He said he is the immediate next door neighbor affected by this decision they are going to make tonight. He said he understands sympathetic causes but he would like to be considered in that same matter too. The next to come forward was Councilor Burr ridge. Councilor Burr ridge said he is the second ward councilor. He said Mr. Smith is an awesome guy but the problem is he's not the person living in these houses or in this ward. He said he can't even find his number and he doesn't know how to get ahold of him. He said he's been taking a lot of phone calls from his neighbors. He said they keep saying these are homeless people and part of that is true. He said some have been released from prison and it has been a halfway house. He said they are at least addicted to alcohol and probably drugs. He said next door there is a little old lady. He said on the other side there is a lady who just bought the place with no knowledge of what is going on. He said next to that they have a disabled sheriff. He said they are the people that are saying they have a problem here. He said his ward has been pretty rundown for many years. He said they are making some tremendous headway. He said this matter has caused a lot of phone calls and a lot of worry. He said he had another person call him and tell him that they are crazy for not letting them do this. He said he's probably received 30 to 40 calls saying they have baseball

fields, a swimming pool, a new beach, and drugs and homeless people in their neighborhoods. He said in the last three months alone he found a person inside his girlfriend's car, a person in his backyard, and something stolen from his driveway in the middle of the daytime. He said this isn't the place for this type of home. He said every time he goes down to the new Lakeside Park there are three or four kids scurrying into the woods or the other side of the fence. He said they are all making homes down there by the lake. He said at 19 Van Buren Street he is dealing with some squatters. He said at the corner of Duer and Oneida Street he has another place with squatters. He said his ward has had enough. He said they need somebody to support them and help them. He said if these were people that were going to stay here and be part of their community then he would say OK. He said the difference is every six months to a year, if they make it that far, they are sent out and new people come in and they start all over again. He said they don't have a really good chance of making it here in the city. He said they put themselves in this position and we try to help them but then they fail. He said Mr. Smith just said they had a problem with someone drinking this weekend and now they are out. He said these problems don't stop and they just keep coming. He said it is hard to break addiction. He said when they come out of prison they don't have a lot to look forward to. He said people don't want to hire them. He said he gets where he is trying to help them but the second ward is not the place they are going to be able to help them. He said all they are going to do is chase people out of his ward. He asked what the cameras are really going to do. He said it'll show someone leaving the house at 9 PM but does it get them anywhere when a house is burglarized at 10 PM. He asked if the cameras will stop anyone from getting hurt. He said they were talking about 10% of them passing. He said all the rest of them are going to be their problem. He said he received a message on his phone saying that this is wrong and the person is going to move out of the second ward and probably out of the city. He said that is what they are going to keep getting. He questioned why you would want to live here if you have to worry about this constantly. He said the people in his ward are afraid to call the police department. He said Mr. Smith is not dealing with this because he doesn't live there. He said he is and his neighbors are. Chairman Clavelli questioned if this gets voted down then he has an apartment house. Mr. Caraccioli said correct. Chairman Clavelli asked if he can rent to the same people. Mr. Caraccioli said he can rent to the same people or anyone. He said if the group residence special permit is voted down he doesn't see anything in the local code that would prohibit any owner of property from renting it out. He said there are probably hundreds of similar properties all over the city. He said the only distinction is this is being considered a group residence. He said if it were to fail he would still have the ability to rent this out. Chairman Clavelli asked if there was anybody in favor of this application and Tom Alton came forward. Mr. Alton said he taught at Oswego High School for 35 years. He said for 30 years he worked with the Gideon's in the Oswego County Jail. He said he has seen some of the worst that they have created. He said he has a distinct memory of a guard talking to an inmate on either side of the bars. He said it occurred to him that they used to sit next to each other in one of his science classes. He said he wondered what it is that makes that difference. He said that some of those kids that squandered their opportunities, burned their bridges, and reached rock bottom asked how they can get out and Mr. Smith was offering them a chance. He said to begin with the population has already failed. He said he's seen a couple of his students who are already homeless in Oswego. He said he asked himself what he can do. He said what he can do is support Bridge to Hope because they

are helping them build some of the bridges they burned and giving them some hope. He said Mr. Smith cares a lot and does as much as he can. He said he quit his job so he could do a better job on helping these kids. He said these are Oswego kids. He said he understands not in my neighborhood but they are going to go somewhere and he would just assume see them with Mr. Smith. The next to come forward was Michael Nupuf of 7363 State Route 104. Mr. Nupuf said he recently stepped down as the medical director of the opioid treatment program at Farnham Family Services. He said he is currently the medical director of the Oswego County Correctional Facility and the medical advisor for Kristina's House of Hope. He said at Farnham their success rate at preventing relapse from opiates is about 70%. He said the number one cause for those individuals that relapse is unstable living arrangements. He said at the correctional facility they spend \$1 million a year incarcerating individuals. He said 30% of those people are incarcerated without homes or unstable living arrangements. He said they spend a great deal of time and money withdrawing them from drugs, treating their mental health issues, and arranging for them to get treatment. He said after weeks or months in the facility when they are at their best they discharge them back to the same environment that got them incarcerated in the first place. He said it's a constant revolving door because as a society they are not prepared to deal with the social aspects of drug abuse and homelessness. He said they have been treating the war on drugs for 40 years and they still aren't successful because they don't understand it. He said there is a stigma against people that use drugs. He said there is a stigma against people with mental health issues. He said as a society they haven't spent the money, time, or effort to solve those issues. He said he would like to address the concerns of Mr. White. He said everything talked about was not related to individuals in a group home dedicated to homelessness. He said those were complaints that anyone could hear of any neighbor who is disrespectful, messy, or doesn't respect his neighbors. He said he is sure the police hear it all the time. He said most of the complaints were about individuals not being respectful and it doesn't mean it is because of their environment but because of who they are. He said if they rented another property they would probably be disrespectful to those neighbors as well. He said it is not the facility that should give Mr. White concern. He said in regard to Councilor Burrige, every issue that the neighbors have are the exact reason why they need more group homes dedicated to individuals with substance abuse and homelessness. He said they need a group home in every ward. He said they have an issue of drug abuse that is rampant in every town in America. He said drug abuse, homelessness, and unstable living arrangements are what are contributing to the neighbor's concerns. He said it isn't the group home. He said the group home reduces those risks. He said that is what the studies show. He said group homes in communities reduce the risk of substance abuse and lawlessness. He said the State of Kentucky developed residence recovery homes for individuals that were released from jail. He said there was a 30% decrease in crimes in every one of those homes and the communities they lived in. He said there is crime and substance abuse in every ward in this city. He said it is not the group home that is going to contribute to that. He said we spend \$120 a day to incarcerate an individual. He said it costs \$40 a day to maintain an individual in a group home. He said the problem is DSS only pays \$20 a day so that is where all the extra funding, donations, and volunteers have to come. He said they need the assistance of the public sector, government, and private sector if they are going to make any effort in stopping the drug abuse and homelessness that exists now in Oswego. The next to come forward was Angela Livingston

of 112 East 10th Street. Ms. Livingston said when they first came to Oswego they were tired of the drugs, tired of wondering if their kids bicycle was going to get stolen, and they were ready to move. She said Mr. Smith got the first house and they considered staying. She said when he got the second house they started the process to buy the house across the street. She said they will stay in the second ward because the group homes are there. She said she has grandchildren on West 8th Street and she wouldn't let her youngest child sell girl scout cookies there until Mr. Smith got his home because now she knows it is okay. She said at least those people are trying and nobody is perfect. She said there is going to be relapses but as long as there is a step forward even with two steps back, if they keep on making an effort then she will take that. She suggested they attack some of those other houses that don't have someone going by at 11:00 pm to see if they are home. She said the cameras will tell them when they are there and when they aren't. She said because of Mr. Smith moving into her neighborhood she feels safer. The next to come forward was Steve Paglioroli of 162 E. 7th Street. Mr. Paglioroli said he had the pleasure of working alongside of some of these men. He said last year they had them help them do some painting at their house. He said you could see from working with them how meaningful that work was. He said it acted to build their self-esteem. He said the guys felt like they were a part of something bigger than themselves. He said it gave them a sense of belonging and they were happy to have them. He said Bridge to Hope gives these men structure, rules to follow, guidance, relationship building, and a sense of community. He said there are countless men living in our community that would benefit from the services provided by Bridge to Hope. He said these men are blessed to have this organization. He said as Oswegonians they are blessed to have Bridge to Hope helping these men on their road to recovery. The next to come forward was a resident of 112½ East Oneida Street. He said he was truly blessed to have Pastor Wade. He said he was addicted and homeless. He said he went to Victory Transformation for help. He said Bridge to Hope is also helping the community by providing houses for the homeless. He said it is a good thing that Pastor Wade is doing because there are others out there struggling and they don't know where to go. He said he was there. He said he didn't know where to go and he was living on the streets. He said what he is doing is a blessing to our community. He said was born and raised in Oswego. He said to see the homeless have a house is much better than seeing them on the street struggling. He said Pastor Wade also helps get people jobs. He said he is grateful to have Pastor Wade and Victory Transformation in our community to help the homeless and those with addiction. The next to come forward was Dawn Whittaker of 5532 State Route 104. Ms. Whittaker said she is also the founder and director of Victory Transformation. She said she does a lot of work with Mr. Smith. She said for the most part neighbors didn't even know these houses were there until this issue was brought to their attention and that should speak volumes. She said early on in Victory's history they had a homeless woman come through there and she is still living in her house. She said she has been living there for 4-5 years. She said she doesn't scare her, she isn't a problem, and she is a part of their family now and she will never ask her to leave. She said she may not be Mr. Smith's 10% but she is somebody's and because of that she was able to pour into this community. She said there are a lot of people like her and there are a lot of people like her that aren't here. She said she wanted to give a shout out to the 10% because they are part of what makes Oswego great. The next to come forward was Dick Wilmott. Mr. Wilmott said he is the pastor of the New Covenant Church. He said they've had the Victory House next to the church

and they have had no problems. He said he has known Mr. Smith for probably 10 years and he is impressed with his heart to help these people. He said he is not an absentee landlord. He said if you want to get ahold of him just talk to him and he will give you his number. He said they hired him to clean their church. He said they trust them and they have keys to the church. He said he endorses these group homes. The next to come forward was Mike Cristino of 35 E. 9th Street. He said he's been a part of this program for some time now and he would like to consider himself as one of the 10%. He said that Mr. Smith has failed to say that he opened a business called New Creations and is able to put a couple of their tenants to work. He said negativity begets negativity. He said he would have something to say against anything these gentlemen have said but he is not going to do that. He said he came into this program homeless and he is an alcoholic. He said he will always be an alcoholic as much as a drug addict will always be a drug addict. He said today he is a certified recovery peer advocate. He said he got his credentials with the help of Mr. Smith. He said 10% might not seem like a whole lot but if they didn't have Bridge to Hope what do you think that percentage would be. He said it would be zero. He said it is not a group home problem. He said it is a city problem now. He said you can drive behind Ollies, Walmart, and Harbor Freight and you can count the number of homeless people. He said there is a gentleman who sits in front of Walmart who is homeless. He said Bridge to Hope is just so aptly named because it gives those people hope who probably have no hope. He said some have come out of prison, some are drug addicts, some alcoholics, and some have mental health issues. He said maybe you know someone that might have mental health or any of these issues and what would you like to have done if that issue was presented to you. He said he doesn't know where he would be because it wouldn't have been the city that would've helped him. He said he knows that they redid the Salvation Army but they don't take in homeless people. He said you can eat there but there is no place to reside. He said it's a safe harbor and a bridge to hope for a lot of them that probably wouldn't have had it. He said Mr. Smith gives them a second chance and everybody deserves a second chance. The next to come forward was Mickey Michalski of 265 E. 9th Street. He said he is a member of Mr. Smith's program. He said he is a grateful, recovering alcoholic and he has been sober for many years now. He said recently circumstances in his life created a situation of homelessness for him. He said Mr. Smith took him in and has brought him to that home and into his home for dinner and Bible studies. He said he worked with him every week cleaning churches and painting a new clothing distribution center under one of the churches where they are going to be giving away good clothes to needy families. He said he found it to be a very beneficial experience for him spiritually, physically, and mentally. He said he doesn't think there are many people on this earth that are as good as Wade and Wendy Smith. He said the work Mr. Smith does is important. The next to come forward was a resident of 35 E. 9th Street. He said Mr. Smith and Victory Transformation saved his neck. He said he was homeless and family wanted nothing to do with him. He said he had no place to go and nothing to eat. He said he was going to sleep in the cold and it hurt that no one cared for him. He said Mr. Smith came to his rescue and saved his neck. He said now he is in a home with good people. He said those kids, even the ones that were in jail for 15 years, were the kindest people ever. He said they were worried about how he was feeling and whether he had enough to eat. Angela Livingston said the parking issue was something that was brought up. She said the problem with helping these guys get cars is as soon as they get it they leave because now they have a job and can pay their

own rent. She said Victory Transformation and Bridge to Hope has Cars for Change and they are trying to get these guys cars. She said they are paying for them to get their driver's license. She said they are paying all the fees and the fines. She said they are doing everything they need to do and when they finally get a car, they get a job and leave. The next to come forward was Mark Bush of 265 E. 9th Street. He said he lives in one of Pastor Wade's houses. He said he had nowhere else to go. He said DSS sent him to the Victory House and he spent Thanksgiving and Christmas there. He said then Pastor Wade took him in. Mark Brunschweiger read the criteria for authorizing a special permit. Michael Nicholson asked if there is a fourth property that isn't listed. Mr. Caraccioli said there are four properties that are used by Grace and Glory but only three are owned by Grace and Glory. Michael Nicholson asked if that should come in for a group home. Mr. Smith said there are three properties that Grace and Glory owns and they are run by Bridge to Hope. He said there is another property that they rent. Jeff McGann said at the time these applications came in he was unaware that there was a fourth house. Anthony Pauldine asked if they are able to do it as they are doing it now then why were they advised to go through this process. He asked if they have to go through this process or do they not have to go through this process. Jeff McGann said it was admitted that it was being used as a group home so that is the reason that they required them to come forward just like Elim Grace and Kristina's House of Hope. He said they are trying to treat everything equally here. Anthony Pauldine asked if this doesn't pass are they using this as a group home or can they have four people that are unrelated and rent to them. Jeff McGann said that is a good question. He said if it comes before them as a group residence their vote would then be on whether or not, given all the facts, they approve of this and give them permission as a special permit. He said beyond that point would be up to code and zoning to follow up on any other issues and hold them liable for any issues that there are. He said because it is admittedly a group residence by zoning law they have to put it in front of them for a special permit. He said at the time that the application was submitted for the rental permit it was being looked into going tax exempt which alerted them to the fact that it was a group residence. Richard Lafond said no property taxes would be paid then. Jeff McGann said at this time he does not believe that is the case. He said he was just inquiring about that at the time. Mr. Smith said they have inquired about being tax exempt but at this time they are not going to pursue that. He said for the past five years they've been paying taxes even though Grace and Glory is a not-for-profit. Chairman Clavelli said one of the stipulations he will put on there is that his phone number will be available to the neighbors and the councilors. Mr. Smith said he is fine with that. He said on their Bridge to Hope Facebook page his phone number is already on there. He said he wants to work with the city and the neighbors. Anthony Pauldine asked for his response to Mr. White's comments. Mr. Smith said some of the incidents he was not even aware of. He said as far as the property line they are going to have it re-surveyed. He said where Mr. White sees the property line and where he sees the property line according to when they bought the house six years ago is very different. He said they are going to have it re-surveyed to resolve that issue. He said he has addressed the smoking with the men. He said he will continue to address that and tell them to stay on the porch and to put their cigarette butts in the bucket there. He said as far as the window, his recollection from five years ago was that they cleaned it up right away. He said he remembers the incident and the glass was put in the next day. He said they covered it with something that evening but they took care of it the next day. He said they want to be a good

neighbor and they want to work with him. He said after the last meeting he asked if there was anything they could do to alleviate some of the tension and his response was to sell the house. He said they want to work with their neighbors to the best of their ability to alleviate any tension that is there. Chairman Clavelli said Mr. White claims that Mr. Smith doesn't want one of these in his neighborhood. Mr. Smith said that is not true. He said if they had the same parameters as what is laid out in Bridge to Hope then he wouldn't have a problem with it at all. Anthony Pauldine said he was concerned that they bought some seriously rundown houses at very low prices. He said he is concerned with a lot of code violations and possibly an unwillingness to work with neighbors. He said it would be always wise to endear the neighbors and not have them show up at a meeting like this. He said he remembers a few years ago when Duffy's on Hawley Street in a great residential area wanted to open up a little shop. He said he went into that meeting vehemently opposed. He said the room was packed more than it is right now and he was shocked that person after person spoke and begged the Board to allow them to do it because they loved the people so much. He said he found himself reversing what he thought in voting for it. He said he is not unsympathetic to his causes. He said he hires some of these people and he has worked with Victory since their formation and hired some of their people. He said in his own home he has people that are homeless that he takes in. He said their purpose here tonight is to look at the possible detriment to the neighborhood and protect the neighborhoods. He said this is an issue in which the city should try to designate some areas that would be more friendly for this. He said he does not believe they should have houses like this in every single ward in every neighborhood. He says he sees that as a detriment. He said the values of the houses may not have diminished but they may in time. He said he can't say there is no possibility of it affecting the neighbors because he does think that it could. He said he's not sure that buying the most run down houses and converting those for this purpose is for the best. Connie Ryan said they are asking for a special permit which allows the Zoning Board to put stipulations on it so they have a little more control. Mr. Caraccioli said that is a benefit of a special use permit. He said it is tantamount that the permitted use is in harmony with the general zoning plan and will not adversely impact the neighborhood. He said they can debate that in any particular use and they have certainly heard multiple examples of that. He said there are permitted uses and uses that are permitted by way of a special permit. He said then there are uses that don't quite fit into a neighborhood and you have the right to apply for a variance and try to persuade the Zoning Board that that variance is acceptable. He said Jeff McGann, as the zoning administrator, has made the determination that Grace and Glory Ministries is required to apply for a special permit because they are presenting their use as a group residence. He said when you look at the zoning code, group residences are allowed in a traditional neighborhood district by way of a special use permit. He said they can overrule that and deny the special permit based on reason and not just arbitrary decision. He said the result of that denial is these are still properties in a residential neighborhood that are subject to a rental permit and all of the other codes and they have to be compliant as the code enforcement office indicated. He said in the final analysis they are properties that can be rented if they obtain a rental permit. He said they have plenty of examples in this community of tenants that are there and they have very little control. He said what this application is offering and what this Board has to consider is whether they want to have some control over this particular use. He said there are 13 house rules. He said number 13 is be considerate of other people living in

the house, if you make a mess please clean it up. He said he would submit that number 14 should read be considerate of your neighbors and treat others as you wish to be treated. Michael Nicholson asked if the last time they made a condition that there had to be in person supervision. Chairman Clavelli said yes. Jeff McGann said it was not someone in the program. Michael Nicholson asked if that is enough. Chairman Clavelli said they can put that in there but it will eliminate a spot for someone in the house. He said they can make it be a supervisor instead of a person in the program. He said they can make it a condition that Mr. Smith has to make weekly visits to these properties. Mr. Smith said he is at these properties almost daily. Richard Lafond asked if these guys can fix up the houses that they are living in. He asked if they have the ability. Mr. Smith said some of them do. Richard Lafond said if the state of the homes were improved upon he thinks they would see a more favorable response from the neighbors. Mr. Caraccioli read the definition of a group residence. He said he doesn't necessarily read that to mean it has to be in-house supervision but there has to be some form of supervision. He says ultimately it is up to this Board to determine the level of that condition. Anthony Pauldine said this is a condition that they put on the house and although it can be revoked if Mr. Smith decided to sell the house would it be automatically eligible to be a group home. Jeff McGann said a special permit is transferrable if it is used for the exact same thing. Chairman Clavelli said any conditions would follow also. Anthony Pauldine said in a home that has seven bedrooms a future owner could have seven residents unless it was stipulated that they could only have four. Mr. Caraccioli said the Board has the right to impose reasonable conditions to grant a special use permit. He said the occupancy of four unrelated adults would be a reasonable condition to impose. He said this would be transferable to subsequent owners. Anthony Pauldine said the person who was in the supervisory position wouldn't be the fifth person. Chairman Clavelli said they would be part of the four. He asked how many bedrooms are in 35 E. 9th Street. Mr. Smith said three. Chairman Clavelli asked about 33 E. 9th Street and Mr. Smith said they have two individuals. Chairman Clavelli said on Seventh Street there are four individuals. Mr. Caraccioli said in terms of the site plan approval the Planning Board conditioned their approval upon adding video cameras, code enforcement conducts exterior and interior inspections, and parking reduction is only allowed for the group residence. He said they can impose additional conditions if they are inclined to. Chairman Clavelli said they don't have to impose those same conditions because they are in the record. Mr. Caraccioli said they are part of the site plan but he would recommend, unless there is a conflicting condition, that they would impose those same conditions on the special permit because that special permit is what's transferable from owner to owner. He said those conditions are also reviewable or a subject of revocation should the need arise in the future. He said this Board retains jurisdiction over this particular use. He said he would add to the conditions that they need to bring the properties into compliance with code and allow the reinspection of the exterior and interior of the properties. Matthew Brancato asked how often those inspections need to be. Mr. Caraccioli said he thinks there should be a time limit established within which those properties need to be brought into compliance. Jeff McGann said he doesn't see why you couldn't say once a year there needs to be an interior and exterior inspection. He said if this does pass the special permit will not go into place until all three of these properties have taken care of the code violations. Mark Donabella said if this doesn't pass he can continue doing what he's doing and the city doesn't have oversight and they can't put in any conditions. Mr. Caraccioli said that is correct.

Michael Nicholson asked if that would prevent them from going tax-exempt. Mr. Caraccioli said he doesn't know if they can make that a condition. He said in order for a residential property to qualify for tax exempt status it has to be within the focus of that tax exemption. He said that is ultimately up to the assessor to determine. He said it is questionable whether it would meet the requirements of a tax exempt status. Jeff McGann said as a rental it would not qualify. He said as a group home it would give them a better opportunity to qualify. Matthew Brancato said the city is not really gaining a whole lot on tax dollars with these properties. Anthony Pauldine said since Mr. Smith has not seen the pictures he wants to make sure that there isn't some kind of a major disconnect between the city expectations and Mr. Smith's. Jeff McGann said he is surprised that he didn't see the violations because violations were sent to the Syracuse Avenue address six days ago. Chairman Clavelli asked if he has them. Mr. Smith said he has not seen them but that does not mean that they weren't delivered to their house and got lost in the shuffle somewhere. Anthony Pauldine asked what his intentions are on the exterior of the one with the green siding. Mr. Smith said they are planning on siding that house with vinyl siding and they are going to change the windows out. He said they will do the soffit and redo the shingles. He said there's also a back portion that code looked at that they have not used. He said it was used as a laundry room previously and there's a lot of rot. He said they have not used it and they are planning on redoing that as well. Chairman Clavelli said he is planning on painting the other places where the windows are peeling. Mr. Smith said they are planning on changing a lot of those windows at 148. He said they have those windows in the garage and they are waiting until the spring to be able to put those windows in. Chairman Clavelli said he thinks Rule #14 is a good rule. He said they want their neighbors to be happy. Mr. Smith said they have tried to do that. Chairman Clavelli said now they are going to try even harder and better. He asked who the alternate is tonight. Jeff McGann said Connie Ryan. Chairman Clavelli said Connie Ryan will not be voting tonight. He asked if they can just vote on all of the properties together. Jeff McGann said he would recommend they vote on each house separately. Chairman Clavelli listed the conditions for the special permit. He said the first condition is add 24 hour video recording that is available and reviewable. He said the second condition is the owner will comply with code enforcement and bring properties into compliance and allow inspections once per year. Mark Donabella said the reason he thinks it is important is because when you fill out a rental permit all these code violations are listed in there. He said he's already violating them so he thinks he should be monitored in some way and make sure those things are being maintained. Chairman Clavelli said if something was in violation it could be brought back and they could reevaluate the permit. Anthony Pauldine asked if each house stands on its own. He asked if there are violations is it one house that is revoked or all three. Mr. Caraccioli said under our current code if there is a violation at one property with common ownership with others then the others are subject to revocation and suspension. He said in this case there are three properties that are owned by Grace and Glory so if one were to be in violation the others would be subject to enforcement. Chairman Clavelli said the third condition is Rule #14 be added to the house list which is be considerate of your neighbors and treat them as you would want to be treated. He said Mr. Smith will be available to the councilors and the neighbors. Mr. Smith said yes. Mr. Caraccioli said he does think it is a reasonable condition that the owner maintains an accessible phone number continuously on the website or social media account. That was added as a fourth condition. Chairman Clavelli

asked if they should state that it needs to remain a two bedroom. Mr. Caraccioli said that is a reasonable condition. He said if the applicant would like to extend it somehow they would have to come back to request that. Chairman Clavelli said the fifth condition is maintain a maximum occupancy of two including supervisor at 33 E. 9th Street, maintain a maximum occupancy of three including supervisor at 35 E. 9th Street, and maintain a maximum occupancy of four including supervisor at 148 W. 7th Street. A vote was taken and the motion failed 3 to 4 (Nay votes from Matthew Brancato, Anthony Pauldine, Mark Brunschweiger, and Mark Donabella).

RESOLVED, that a Special Permit be denied to allow for a group residence.

MOTION MADE BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Brunschweiger

SECONDED BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Chairman Clavelli

CITY OF OSWEGO, NEW YORK

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

RESOLUTION

CASE NO: 21-22

IN THE MATTER OF: Wade Smith

WHEREAS, Wade Smith, owner of property situate in a TN2, Traditional Neighborhood 2 Zoning District in the 2nd Ward of the City of Oswego, New York, with address 35 East Ninth Street, being Tax Map Number: 128.24-04-27, has applied for a Special Permit in accordance to Section 280-13(B) of the City of Oswego Code, to allow for a group residence and;

WHEREAS, due public notice having been given of a Hearing on said matter to be held on the 16th day of March 2021 and the applicant having appeared.

A vote was taken and the motion failed 3 to 4 (Nay votes from Matthew Brancato, Anthony Pauldine, Mark Brunschweiger, and Mark Donabella).

RESOLVED, that a Special Permit be denied to allow for a group residence.

MOTION MADE BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Brunschweiger

SECONDED BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Chairman Clavelli

CITY OF OSWEGO, NEW YORK

ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

RESOLUTION

CASE NO: 21-25

IN THE MATTER OF: Wade Smith

WHEREAS, Wade Smith, owner of property situate in a TN2, Traditional Neighborhood 2 Zoning District in the 3rd Ward of the City of Oswego, New York, with address 148 West Seventh Street, being Tax Map Number: 128.61-02-15, has applied for a Special Permit in accordance to Section 280-13(B) of the City of Oswego Code, to allow for a group residence and;

WHEREAS, due public notice having been given of a Hearing on said matter to be held on the 16th day of March 2021 and the applicant having appeared.

A vote was taken and the motion failed 3 to 4 (Nay votes from Matthew Brancato, Anthony Pauldine, Mark Brunschweiger, and Mark Donabella). After the vote Mr. Smith asked for some clarification. He said now he doesn't need to put in the video surveillance. Chairman Clavelli said that is correct. Mr. Smith said he can still rent them to whoever he wants with the same stipulations he has always had. Chairman Clavelli said yes. Mr. Smith said it will be every three years he will get his rental permits the same as he has been doing. Chairman Clavelli said he will maintain the houses as code enforcement requires. Mr. Smith said he will add Rule #14.

RESOLVED, that a Special Permit be denied to allow for a group residence.

MOTION MADE BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Mark Brunschweiger

SECONDED BY ZONING BOARD MEMBER: Chairman Clavelli